

TOWN HALL BUILDING COMMITTEE

NOTES FROM MEETING

September 23, 2019

Members Present: Jay Butler, Mike Twomey, Patrick Reffett, Tim Olson, Jack Lawrence, Jean-Pierre Minois, Jeff Hubbard (part-time)

Members Absent: Bill Olson

Others Present: Owner Project Manager (OPM), Lee Sollenberger and John Sayre-Scibona of Design Technique (DTI); Designer/Architect, Drayton Fair and Mallory Demty of Lerner, Ladds, Bartels (LLB); Cost Estimators, Seamus Fennessy and Mark Cardosa of Fennessy Consulting Services (FCS); and Cost Estimator, Denise Kelly of PM&C.

Document References:

- (1) PM&C Design Development Estimate, Option A September 20, 2019
- (2) PM&C Design Development Estimate, Option B September 20, 2019
- (3) FCS Design Development Cost Report, September 21, 2019 (Option A)

Mike Twomey opened the meeting at 10:12 AM in the Memorial Room at Town Hall.

Following brief introductions all around, Mike pointed out that the purpose of the meeting was to reconcile the independent FCS Town Hall Building Option A Design Development cost estimate with the similar estimate by LLB consultant, PM&C.

The reconciliation effort spanned several hours and followed the line by line comparison of dollars estimated in each document. When disparities were noted, the typical questions back and forth noted if the same detail items were included or if different base costs were chosen. The following are a series of random comments made during the reconciliation.

General Conditions and Fees and Design and Pricing Contingencies – both estimates were changed to agree with one another.

Gross Square Footage – both estimates were in agreement at 11, 733 square feet. Mallory will release a memo that explains how this number was determined.

Escalation Factor – FCS adjusted the start date for construction to June 2020 to agree with 3% by PM&C.

Bonds and Insurance – Both agreed to 3%

Site Work – the major initial differences were due to the amount of paving required in back of the building so it was agreed to pave only up to the DPW fence.

Side Entrance Steps – FCS had estimated granite pavers while PM&C had assumed cement so it was changed to cement

Curbing – curbing will not be used around the buildings. Tim said if curbing was installed, it had to be put in during the summer so people can see it before the snow plows wrecked it

Utilities – reconciled

Drain Pipes/Hydrant – a discussion ensued about placing a new hydrant next to the building as well as a new water line for the fire protection system

Lights – similar estimates

Demolition – PM&C added some dollars for the roof

Shoring – the need for shoring was discussed for the new elevator

Blown-in insulation – now part of estimate

Underpinnings – the need for underpinnings was discussed for the new vault

Concrete – the numbers were made comparable

Chimney- The chimney is no longer needed but since it can be viewed from the street, the Historical District Commission will most likely want to keep it, and changing to a fiberglass version is really not an option. Thus, approximately \$30K was left in the estimate for repointing and support.

Metal – these numbers were reconciled

Exterior Clapboard Replacement – the amount budgeted for 25% of clapboards to be replaced was questioned but it was kept as an allowance

Attic Framing – Seamus questioned the note on the PM&C cost estimate that read, “The contractor to investigate attic framing and provide supplemental supports as required -allowance - \$24K”. He felt some investigation should be done instead of leaving it up to the contractor. Lee suggested hiring another contractor now to open up the ceiling above the DPW department to investigate. Some combination of Mike, Seamus and Mallory discussed placing the cost for ceiling joists in the estimate. A cost was added.

Roof – a discussion ensued about the roof in terms of the need or appropriateness of an interior vapor barrier. It was decided to have an ice and water shield over the second layer of plywood and no vapor barrier. The cost estimate had aluminum gutters and downspouts but Drayton pointed out that the Historical Society would most likely want copper so some money was added. Mallory indicated that some fly ash based wood composite would be used for fascia boards but wood will be used everywhere else with no PVC composites.

Air Conditioning System – A question was raised about what was needed to allow the A/C system to operate properly and it was unanimous that the windows should not be allowed to open and likely should be nailed shut or at least be permanently closed and weather stripped. Drayton suggested sealing the windows and adding interior storm windows. Mallory suggested to do nothing but just seal the windows. Mike noted that John Rodenhizer has not sent any recommendations to date.

Plastering – John noted that plastering tends to be a real “budget buster” in terms of actual costs vs. estimates. He indicated that he knew of only two companies bidding on public work of this nature. Only one company was currently doing it and even then, that company came in 100% over budget on a recent job. A debate then ensued over level 3 vs. level 5 plastering and what was appropriate for the domed ceiling as well as all other walls. It was decided to use a plastic veneer over the blue board.

Lockers – Tim suggested increasing the number of lockers from 8 to 14.

Fire Protection – Mallory suggested that it would be necessary to increase the amount for this category to provide sprinklers for the attic and mezzanine. Drayton will check to see about the number of dry vs. wet fire protection systems. There was also a debate about the dollar per foot costs assumptions.

Plumbing – the number of bath rooms was agreed to at 6. Mike noted that an additional \$20K was needed for a pump to remove storm water from the basement. Jay asked and Lee replied that the planned moisture investigation for the basement should not affect the cost estimates.

Lunch - During a mini-break in the discussions around noon time, John suggested ordering pizza for lunch but only Jay, maybe Lee and Drayton showed much interest. However, approximately 45 minutes later with Denise fading and suggesting we did not want to see her getting hungry, Mike offered to call Essex Pizza and have it delivered. With a little more difficulty in determining how many pizzas and what type than the cost estimating effort, he stepped out and ordered and then paid for them out of pocket. He over-estimated by one pizza but I think the DPW crew will think kindly of him.

Generator – an emergency generator was added back into the estimate but both the size at 100 kW and the cost for associated wiring and installation was in question. Denise, Mallory, and Drayton will go back and determine what is needed. The plan is that the generator would power the entire building during a power outage.

Lightning Protection – this was added to the estimate at \$13K.

Summary of Cost Estimates Reconciliation

At the end of the reconciliation discussions, the draft Option A Detailed Design Cost Estimate by PM&C was \$6,012,891 vs. the FCS estimate of \$6,241,900, for a difference of \$229,009.

Secretary's Note: This Detailed Design Cost estimate for Option A by PM&C as compared to the March 2019 PM&C Conceptual Cost Estimate of \$5,829,060 shows an increase of \$183,831.

The updated September 20, 2019 PM&C Detailed Design Cost Estimate for Option B was \$6,667,155 but it does need to be upgraded to account for all of the Option A reconciliation actions of today's meeting. However, prior to the further reconciliation, the difference between Option A and B is that Option B is higher by \$654,264 and may increase slightly.

John and Mike indicated that DTI's soft costs represent a 47% increase to get to the full project cost. Thus, while DTI's estimates still need some discussion and negotiation, the Option A Full Project Cost is approximately \$8.548M and Option B Full Project Cost is at \$9.377M for a difference of \$829K.

Town Meeting Discussion

Both Mike, Jack, and Jay talked about what will happen at the upcoming Town Meeting. Jay mentioned that the decision of Option A vs. B might be made by Town Meeting. Mike mentioned that with the HHDC against Option A we may not get approval. Jack mentioned Doug Trees and his opposition to the project. Mike briefly mentioned the plan for presentations and that he will quote part of Jay's overview document. Drayton noted that we need to clearly explain why this renovation is needed. Jay warned that presentations for Town meeting will be due way in advance of Town Meeting. Mallory mentioned that the estimated cost is due for the Town Meeting warrant this Thursday.

Miscellaneous

Mike mentioned that there was still a couple of office layout issues pending.

Action Items:

- Mallory – release copy of memo that established gross square footage estimate
- Drayton – Investigate number of dry vs. wet fire protection systems needed
- Denise, Mallory, and Drayton – estimate size and support equipment for emergency generator
- Denise – update Option A and B cost estimates
- John and Lee – update DTI's soft cost estimate
- Mike – suggest solution for Board of Health agent and Planning Director on office layout

Mike set the next THBC meeting for Wednesday, September 25, 2019 at 5:00 PM in the Memorial Room at Town Hall. LLB will participate by telephone.

Meeting was adjourned at 2:35 PM.

Secretary

Jay Butler

Attested 9/23/19